Review

PENDING PROBLEM OF "SILENT" HUMAN IMMUNODEFICIENCY VIRUS INFECTION

Zvi BENTWICH^{1,∠3}, Sara BAR-YEHUDA¹, Kazushige NAGAI², Mark A. WAINBERG², Alexander KALINKOVICH¹ and Tamar JEHUDA-COHEN³

 Ruth Ben Ari Institute of Clinical Immunology, Kaplan Hospital, Hebrew University Medical School, 76100 Rehovot, Israel
 McGill AIDS Centre, Lady Davis Research Institute, Montreal, Canada
 Department of Infectious Diseases, Chaim-Sheba Medical Center, Tel-Hashomer, Israel

Accepted February 7, 1995

Abstract - The problem of "silent" HIV infection is reviewed. Overall, the number of proven "silent" infection in several at-risk populations, including HIV exposed health-care workers, homosexuals, IV drug addicts and children born to HIV-infected mothers, has been very low. Contrary to these observations, we describe a very high prevalence of HIV specific immunity and positive HIV specific PCR signals in an Ethiopian immigrant population recently arrived in Israel. The interpretation of these findings is not entirely clear but we suggest that host immunity and probably different handling of the infection may account for the longer persistence of viral components in the body. Further studies are required to determine the amount and nature of these viral elements and, most importantly, whether they are still infectious.

Key words: "Silent" HIV infection, HIV specific immunity, HIV risk groups, Ethiopian immigrants

THE GENERAL PROBLEM

The human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) is recognized as the etiologic agent of the acquired ir unodeficiency syndrome (AIDS). The diagnosis or IV infection is based primarily on the presence of antibodies to the viral antigens in the serum and is used for screening of infected individuals and of blood for transfusion. Detection of viral antigens (p24) or of virus by culture and isolation and more recently detection of viral sequences by the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) have also been used for the diagnosis of HIV infection. Antibodies to HIV-1 usually develop within 3 to 12 weeks following HIV-1 infection (Gaines et al., 1987). The duration of the so-called "window" period, i.e., seronegative yet infected with the virus, is somewhat Variable and depends also on the route of infection.

The period of such latent seronegative HIV-l infection may be 1-2 months in blood-borne infections (Fincher et al., 1989; Vittecog et al., 1986), while periods of more than 6 months have been reported in sexually transmitted HIV infection (Ranki et al., 1987). The cause for these variations is not clear but may be due to differences in the virulence, infectious dose, mode of transmission, host response and frequency of exposure.

THE "SILENT" INFECTION

The existence of individuals with "silent infection" i.e. with no detectable HIV antibodies yet proven to be infected with HIV for a prolonged period has been reported since 1984 (Groopman et al., 1985; Nagao et al., 1991; Ranki et al., 1987; Salahuddin et

al., 1984; Vaira et al., 1990). The first report published by Salahuddin et al. (1984) described four individuals, three of whom were symptom free and one with lymphoadenopathy, who were sexual partners of patients with AIDS or AIDS-related complex (ARC) and though found to be HIV seronegative. Virus was isolated from their peripheral blood cells. Groopman et al. (1985) reported on two individuals, one with AIDS and one with ARC who were HIV antibody negative but culture positive. Since then, more cases of the same kind have been reported in the United States or elsewhere (Aiuti et al., 1993; Imagawa et al., 1989; Nagao et al., 1991; Ranki et al., 1987; Vaira et al., 1990; Wolinsky et al., 1989). Ranki et al. (1987) reported that HIV antigen and/or low-titer antibodies to recombinant HIV proteins were seen in serum samples 6-14 months before overt seroconversion in 9 subjects who were initially ELISA negative and 7 subjects who had not seroconverted for 7 to 34 months since the first detection of HIV antigen or low-level antibodies against HIV core protein in serum samples. Imagawa et al. (1989) reported on isolation of HIV from blood samples obtained from 31 of 133 seronegative homosexual men who continued to be involved in high-risk sexual activity, and only 4 of the 31 men had seroconverted after 11 to 17 months of the initial isolation of the virus. The remaining 27 men did not seroconvert 28 to 36 months after HIV-l isolation. Moreover, they demonstrated that HIV-l provirus had been present in cryopreserved lymphocytes 23 to 35 months before seroconversion in 3 of the 4 seroconverted men by using PCR. Wolinsky et al. (1989) described HIV-1 DNA sequences detected in peripheral blood mononuclear cells at least 6 months and as long as 42 months (median, 18 months) before seroconversion, in 20 homosexual men. HIV-I was also isolated from peripheral blood mononuclear cells 6 to 18 months before seroconversion in three of them. More recently, Aiuti et al. (1993) reported that 12 of 65 high-risk HIV-l-antibody-negative individuals were shown by PCR to be carriers of HIV-1 proviral sequences. Of these carriers, seven remained seronegative for a period of 10 to 14 months and two were seronegative for 16 and 18 months after the first positive PCR.

Furthermore, they isolated HIV-1 from cell-free plasma in two of 10 PCR-positive, antibody-negative subjects, who remained seronegative 10 months after the determination of plasma viremia. In another study (Jehuda-Cohen et al., 1990) the "silent HIV infection" was detected first by a test that was designed to detect HIV specific B-cells, in vitro, following polyclonal B cell activation (PBAT). Of 165 seronegative individuals at risk for HIV, 30 made HIV specific antibodies in vitro. Approximately half of these were found to be PCR-positive too. A more recent study of seronegative wives of seropositive Ethiopian men, found 7/13 of these women to be PCR-positive for HIV (Jehuda-Cohen et al., 1992).

THE RISKS

There is however a considerable number of other studies that suggest that such "silent" infections are very rare among high-risk individuals who remain seronegative for prolonged periods. Horsburgh et al. (1990) investigated 208 individuals at high risk for HIV-l infection who remained seronegative, HIV-l DNA was detected by PCR in only seven of the 208 samples. Of these seven PCR-positive, antibody-negative individuals, four were seronegative when retested 5 to 21 weeks later and two were considered false-positive PCR because follow-up PCRs were all HIV-l negative. Pan et al. (1991) reported that only one out of 59 individuals seronegative men practising high- or medium-risk sexual behavior was identified as HIV positive by PCR. Other reports reached similar results and concluded that these silent states were extremely rare (Gupta et al., 1992; Lifson et al., 1990; Mariotti et al., 1990; Shepparol et al., 1991).

The existence of HIV-l positive, seronegative individuals for a prolonged period provoked serious concern about the safety of blood transfusion by the screened blood. Indeed, some cases were reported that became infected with HIV-l after receiving blood or organs from donors who were screened as seronegative at the time of donation (Cohen et al.,

1989; Conley et al., 1992; Donahue et al., 1990; Irani et al., 1991; Kleiman et al., 1988; Simonds et al., 1992; Ward et al., 1988).

The estimation of the risk of HIV-l transmission by transfusion from a unit of blood collection was performed in the United States (Alter et al., 1990; Busch et al., 1990, 1991; Cumming et al., 1989; Tessman, 1991). The estimation of the risk of transmission of HIV-l from a unit of screened blood collection was as follows: 1:153,000 per unit transfused in over 17 million donated bloods screened for HIV by the American Red Cross (Cumming et al., 1989), 1:68,000 per unit in 739,700 units collected in Los Angeles and Orange Counties (Kleiman et for cardiac surgery in Baltimore and Houston (Busch et al., 1991) and 1:61,171 per unit in 71,800 donations in San Francisco (Alter et al., 1990). In view of these results, the chance of HIV-l transmission from transfusion of blood or blood product which have been screened for antibodies to HIV-lis indeed very small. Though there are still few who interpret the accumulated data differently and claim that based on the statistical limits of the above studies the risk could be as high as 1 in 10,695 units (Tessman, 1991). The attempt to use HIV-l p24 antigen detection in screening of blood donors for improvement of the transfusion safety has not revealed any earlier detection (Alter et al., 1990; Busch et al., 1990).

we have preliminary evidence that exposure and infection indeed occur and later clear without seroconversion (Bentwich and Bar-Yehuda, 1994). It may very well fit with some of the questionable previous observations that were difficult to reproduce and repeat (Imagawa et al., 1989). It would also fit with the recent observations by Rowland-Jones et al. (1993) on HIV specific CTL in such children and with observations made by Clerici et al. (1993) on HIV specific cellular immunity in children born to HIV positive mothers. More recent studies by Shearer's and other groups including our own, have established the presence of HIV specific immunity in exposed yet seronegative individuals (Beretta et

al., 1994; Clerici et al., 1992; Kelker et al., 1992; Pinto et al., 1994; Rowland-Jones et al., 1995). In these studies mostly T-cell response to HIV envelope peptides was determined, but also HIV specific CTL response was used. Interestingly, health care workers who were exposed to the virus were also found to have such immunity up to 12 months post exposure (Pinto et al., 1994). Altogether PCR determination in the various groups of immunity positive seronegative individuals studied, was mostly negative except in children born to HIV seropositive mothers, where 13% of the children had positive signals (Clerici et al., 1993) and in only a few isolated cases where late seroconversion was observed several months after HIV specific immunity was detected (Clerici et al., 1992).

THE ETHIOPIAN IMMIGRANTS

On this background, we have made some recent interesting observations in a population of Ethiopian new immigrants to Israel that seem to be somewhat different and may shed further light on this problem. Using both the PBAT assay, and the generation of IL-2 following exposure of PBMC to HIV envelope peptides, i.e. B and T-cell specific response assays respectively, we have found a surprisingly high prevalence of HIV specific immunity in non-exposed Ethiopians. Thus, 31 out of 60 of these individuals (51%), had such immune responses without any clear history of prior exposure to HIV (Bentwich and Bar-Yehuda, 1994). Furthermore, we were able to study more thoroughly 24 of them and repeat the study one year later. In the first determination, the T-cell response was positive in 70% while the B cell response (PBAT) was positive in only 37%. One year later, the B cell response became positive in 62% of the group and the T-cell response found in 87% of them, though they were still all HIV seronegative. At the same time, the number of individuals having a positive PCR signal for HIV sequences was only six, and in none of them was virus cultured. The interpretation of these findings is not quite clear and is now under intensive study. Due to the combined presence of B and T-cell HIV

specific response to several HIV antigens, it is difficult to ascribe such phenomena to anything else but to a true immune response to HIV antigens. Thus, it is quite plausible that the increasing signs of specific immunity to HIV, are evidence for previous exposure to HIV probably in Ethiopia, with continuous antigenic stimulation and drive. It may signify that HIV antigens - "defective", "digested", or true infectious viral particles are present in lymph nodes or macrophages. The small number of individuals in whom PCR was found positive may probably reflect the extremely low number of these viral particles. However, further work to rule out the possibility of some cross reactive antigens in these instances is also needed (Mutch et al., 1994).

Why do we observe such findings in this population that have not been observed so far in any western populations? Is there something unique in the setting or background of the Ethiopian population that makes it different in the way it handles and disposes of HIV infection? The answer to these questions is still not known and remains to be fully investigated. However, we favor the idea that the high endemic infections load and mostly the helminthic infections present in Ethiopia and probably in other African countries plays a central role in making the African pattern of AIDS very different from the Western pattern of the epidemic (Bentwich et al., 1995). We have suggested that activation of the immune system by those infections makes the host more susceptible to HIV infection and less capable to cope with it. By the same token, we suggest that the immune activated and non HIV infections' burdened individual is not able to dispose and clear the HIV infection in the same way as an individual who is not similarly infected. Thus, the background of Africa and probably of other developing countries, may also give rise to a higher prevalence of "silent" HIV infection than that observed in the developed western countries. The meaning of such "silent" infection remains to be characterized much better, especially as regards its potential for live infection, let alone the nature and amount of viral antigens. We certainly agree with the suggestions made earlier by Koup and Ho (1991) that such findings should be viewed

with extreme caution and that PCR and culture contamination should be rigorously excluded. However, the importance and implications of such a possibility cannot be overemphasized. Careful longitudinal studies and better definition of the circumstances and causes for "silent" infection are needed. More importantly, readiness to pursue and seek the resolution of this extremely controversial, dangerous and not so popular subject but yet of profound implication should be encouraged, especially in Africa and in the developing countries.

REFERENCES

- Aiuti, F., Ensoli, F., Fiorelli, V., Mezzaroma, I., Pinter, E., Guerra, E. and Varani, A.R., Silent HIV infection. Vaccine 1993, II: 538-541.
- Alter, H.J., Epstein, J.S., Swenson, S.G., VanRaden, M.J., Ward, J.W., Kaslow, R.A., Menitove, J.E., Klein, H.G., Sandler, S.G., Sayers, M.H., Hewlett, I.K. and Chernoff, A.I., The HIV-Antigen Study Group. Prevalence of human immunodeficiency virus type-l p24 antigen in U.S. blood donors - An assessment of the efficacy of testing in donor screening. N. Engl. J. Med. 1990, 323: 1313-1317.
- Bentwich, Z. and Bar-Yehuda, S., HIV specific immunity in seronegative Ethiopian immigrants: evidence for HIV exposure, silent infection or immune cross reactivity. AIDS Res. hum. Retrovir. 1994, 10(Suppl. 3): S143.
- Bentwich, Z., Kalinkovich, A. and Weisman, Z., Immune activation is a dominant factor in the pathogenesis of African AIDS. *Immunol. Today* 1995 april, in press,
- Beretta, A., Rappocciolo, G., Lopalco, L., Weiss, S., DeSantis, G., Shearer, G.M., Lazzarin, A., Siccardi, A. and Clerici, M., Antibodies to HLA class I antigens in seronegative individuals at risk for HIV exposure. AIDS Res. hum. Retrovir. 1994, 10(Suppl. 3): 134.
- Busch, M.P., Taylor, P.E., Lenes, B.A., Kleinman, S.H., Stuart, M., Sterens, C.E., Tomasulo, P.A., Allain, J.-P., Hollingsworth, C.G. and Mosley, J.W., The Transfusion Safety Study Group. Screening of selected male blood donors for p24 antigen of human immunodeficiency virus type l. N. Engl. J. Med. 1990, 323: 1308-1312.
- Busch, M.P., Eble, B.E., Khayam-Bashi, H., Heilbron, D., Murphy, E.L., Kwok, S., Sninsky, J., Perkins, H.A. and Vyas, G.N., Evaluation of screened blood donations for human immunodeficiency virus type-1 infection by culture and DNA amplification of pooled cells. N. Engl. J. Med. 1991, 325: 1-5.
- Clerici, M., Giorgi, J.V., Chow, C.-C., Gudeman, V.K., Zack, J.A., Gupta, P., Ho, H.N., Nishanian, P.G., Berzofsky, J.A. and Shearer, G.M., Cell mediated immune response to HIV-l in seronegative homosexual men with recent sexual exposure to HIV-l. J. infect. Dis. 1992, 165: 1012-1019

- Clerici, M., Sison, A.V., Berzofsky, J.A., Rakusan, T.A., Brandt, C.D., Ellaurie, M., Villa, M., Colie, C., Venson, D.J., Sever, J.L. and Shearer, G.M., Cellular immune factors associated with mother-to-infant transmission of HIV. AIDS 1993, 7: 1427-1434.
- Cohen, N.D., Munoz, A., Reitz, B.A., Neso, P.K., Frazier, O.H., Yawn, D.H., Lee, H., Blattner, W., Donahue, J.G., Nelson, K.E. and Polk, B.F., Transmission of retrovirus by transfusion of screened blood in patients undergoing cardiac surgery. N. Engl. J. Med. 1989, 320: 1172-1176.
- Conley, L.J. and Holmberg, S.D., Transmission of AIDS from blood screened negative for antibody to the human immunodeficiency virus. N. Engl. J. Med. 1992, 326: 1499-1500.
- Cumming, P.D., Wallace, E.L., Schorr, J.B. and Dodd, R.Y., Exposure of patients to human immunodeficiency virus through the transfusion of blood components that test antibody-negative. N. Engl. J. Med. 1989, 321: 941-946.
- Donahue, J.G., Nelson, K.E., Munoz, A., McAllister, H.A., Yawn, D.H., Neso, P.M. and Cohen, N.D., Transmission of HIV by transfection of screened blood. N. Engl. J. Med. 1990, 323: 1709-?.
- Fincher, R.M., Silva, M.D., Lobel, S. and Spencer, M., AIDS-related complex in a heterosexual man seven weeks after a transfusion. N. Engl. J. Med. 1989, 313: 1226-1227.
- Gaines, H., von Sydow, M., Sonnerberg, A., Albert, J., Czajkowski, J., Pershon, P.O., Chiodi, F., Moberg, L., Fenyo, E.M. and Asjo, B., Antibody response in primary human immunodeficiency virus infection. *Lancet* 1987, i(8544): 1249-1253.
- Groopman, J.E., Hartzband, P.I., Shulman, L., Salahuddin, S.Z., Sarngadharan, M.G., McLane, M.F., Essex, M. and Gallo, R., Antibody seronegative human T-lymphotropicvirus type III (HTLV-III)-infected patients with acquired immunodeficiency syndrome or related disorders. *Blood* 1985, 66: 742-744.
- Gupta, P., Kingsley, L., Anderson, R., Ho, M., Enrico, A., Ding, M., Cottrill, M., Wolinsky, S. and Rinaldo, C., Low prevalence of HIV in high-risk seronegative homosexual men evidenced by virus culture and polymerase chain reaction. AIDS 1992, 6: 1413-1419.
- Horsburgh, C.R.Jr, Ou, C.Y., Jason, J., Holmberg, S.D., Lifson, A.R., Moore, J.L., Ward, J.W., Seage, G.R., Mayer, K.H., Eratt, B.L., Schochetman, G. and Jaffe, H.W., Concordance of polymerase chain reaction with human immunodeficiency virus antibody detection. J. infect. Dis. 1990, 162: 542-545.
- Imagawa, D.T., Lee, M.H., Wolinsky, S.M., Sano, K., Morales, K., Kwok, S., Sninsky, J.J., Nishanian, P.G., Giorgi, J., Fahey, J.L., Dudley, J., Visscher, B.R. and Detels, R., Human immunodeficiency virus type 1 infection in homosexual men who remain seronegative for prolonged periods. N. Engl. J. Med. 1989, 320: 1458-1462.
- Irani, M.S., Dudley, A.W. and Lucco, L.J., Case of HIV-l transmission by antigen-positive antibody-negative blood. N. Engl. J. Med. 1991, 325: 1174.
- Jehuda-Cohen, T., Slade, B.A., Powelll, J.D., Villinger, F., De, B., Folks, T.M., McClure, H.M., Sell, K.W. and Ahmed-Ansari, A., Polyclonal B-cell activation reveals

- antibodies against human immunodeficiency virus type (HIV-I) in HIV-I-seronegative individuals. *Proc. natn. Acad. Sci.* USA 1990, **87**: 3972-3976.
- Jehuda-Cohen, T., Vonsover, A., Miltchen, R. and Bentwich, Z., "Silent" HIV infection among wives of seropositive HIV carriers in the Ethiopian community in Israel. Scand. J. Immunol. 1992, 36(Suppl. 11): 81-83.
- Kelker, H.C., Seidlin, M., Volger, M. and Valentine, F.T., Lymphocytes from long-term seronegative heterosexual partners of HIV-infected individuals proliferate in response to HIV antigens. AIDS Res. hum. Retrovir. 1992, 8: 1355-1359.
- Kleiman, S. and Scord, K., Risk of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) transmission by anti-HIV negative blood. Estimation using the lookback methodology. *Transfusion* 1988, 28: 499-501.
- Koup, R.A. and Ho, D.D., Immunosilent HIV infection: intrigue continues. AIDS 1991, 5: 1263.
- Lifson, A.R., Stanley, M., Pane, J., O'Malley, P.M., Wilber, J.C., Stanley, A., Jeffery, B., Rutherfold, G.W. and Sohmer, P.R., Detection of human immunodeficiency virus DNA using the polymerase chain reaction in a wellcharacterized group of homosexual and bisexual men. J. infect. Dis. 1990, 161: 436-439.
- Mariotti, M., Refrere, J.J., Noel, B., Ferrer-Le-Coecor, F., Vittecoq, D., Girot, R., Bosser, C., Courouce, A.M., Salmon, C. and Rouger, P., DNA amplification of HIVl in seronegative individuals and in seronegative at-risk individuals. AIDS 1990, 4: 633-637.
- Mutch, D., Underwood, J., Geysen, M. and Rodda, S., Comprehensive T-cell epitope mapping of HIV-l euv antigens reveals many areas recognized by HIV-l seropositive and by low-risk HIV-l seronegative individuals. J. acq. imm. Defic. Syndr. 1994, 7: 879-890.
- Nagao, T., Honda, K., Yoshihara, N. and Nakanaga, K., Delayed human immunodeficiency virus-1 seroconversion in a hemophilia B patient in Japan. *Blood* 1991, 78: 1893-1894.
- Pan, L.Z., Sheppard, H.W., Winkelstein, W. and Levy, J.A., Lack of detection human immunodeficiency virus in persistently seronegative homosexual men with high or medium risks for infection. J. infect. Dis. 1991, 164: 962-964.
- Pinto, L.A., Sullivan, J., Landay, A., Lucey, D., Clerici, M., Berzofsky, J., Kessler, H.A. and Shearer, G.M., HIVspecific Thelper and cytotoxic responses in seronegative health care workers after HIV exposure. AIDS Res. hum. Retrovir. 1994, 10(Suppl. 3): S133.
- Ranki, A., Valle, S.L., Krohn, M., Antonen, J., Allain, J.P., Leuther, M., Franchini, G. and Krohn, K., Long latency precedes overt seroconversion in sexually transmitted human-immunodeficiency-virus infection. *Lancet* 1987, ii(8559): 589-593.
- Rowland-Jones, S.L., Nixon, D.F., Aldous, M.C., Gotch, F., Ariyoshi, K., Hallam, N., Kroll, J.S., Froebel, K. and McMichael, A., HIV-specific cytotoxic T-cell activity in an HIV-exposed but uninfected infant. *Lancet* 1993, 341: 860-861.
- Rowland-Jones, S., Sutton, J., Ariyoshi, K., Dong, T., Gotch, F., McDam, S., Whitby, D., McMichael, A. and Whittle,

- H., HIV-Specific cytotoxic T-cells in HIV-exposed but uninfected Gambian women. Nature Med. 1995, 1: 59-64.
- Salahuddin, S.Z., Groopman, J.E., Markham, P.D., Sarngadharan, M.G., Redfield, R.R., McLane, M.F., Essex, M., Sliski, A. and Gallo, R.C., HTLV-III in symptom-free seronegative persons. *Lancet* 1984, ii(8417-8418): 1418-1420.
- Shepparol, H.W., Dondero, D., Annon, J. and Winkelstein, W.Jr., An evaluation of the polymerase chain reaction in HIV-1 seronegative men. J. acq. imm. Defic. Syndr. 1991, 4: 819-823.
- Simonds, R.J., Holmberg, S.D., Hurwitz, R.L., Coleman, T.R., Bottenfield, S., Conley, L.J., Kohlenberg, S.H., Castro, K.G., Dahan, B.A., Schable, C.A., Rayfield, M.A. and Rogers, M.F., Transmission of human immunodeficiency virus type-1 from a seronegative organ and tissue donor. N. Engl. J. Med. 1992, 326: 726-732.
- Tessman, I., The risk of HIV-1 in screened blood donations.

 N. Engl. J. Med. 1991, 325: 1746-1747.
- Vaira, D., Francois-Gerard, Ch., Doppagne, A., Sondag-

- Thull, D. and Rentier, B., Diagnosis by PCR of HIV-1 infection in seronegative individuals at risk. AIDS Res. hum. Retrov. 1990, 6: 173-174.
- Vittecog, D., Autran, B., Bourstyn, E. and Chermann, J.C., Lymphadenopathy syndrome and seroconversion two months after single use of needle shared with an AIDS patient. Lancet 1986, i(8492): 1280.
- Ward, J.W., Holmberg, S.D., Allen, J.R., Cohn, D.L., Critchley, S.E., Kleiman, S.H., Lenes, B.A., Ravenholt, O., Davis, J.R., Quinn, M.G. and Jaffe, H.W., Transmission of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) by blood transfusions creened as negative for HIV antibody. N. Engl. J. Med. 1988, 318: 473-478.
- Wolinsky, S.M., Rinaldo, C.R., Kwok, S., Sninsky, J.J., Gupta, P., Imagawa, D., Frazadegan, H., Jacobson, L.P., Grovit, K.S., Lee, M.H., Chmiel, J.S., Ginzburg, H., Klaslow, R.A. and Phair, J.P., Human immunodeficiency virus type-l (HIV-l) infection a median of 18 months before a diagnostic Western blot. Evidence from a cohort of homosexual men. Ann. int. Med. 1989, Ill: 961-972.